

TYPO3 Core - Bug #31951

Own checkbox layout breaks HTML mail

2011-11-20 13:02 - Michael Feinbier

Status:	Closed	Start date:	2011-11-20
Priority:	Should have	Due date:	
Assignee:		% Done:	100%
Category:	Form Framework	Estimated time:	0.00 hour
Target version:		Complexity:	
TYPO3 Version:	6.2	Is Regression:	No
PHP Version:		Sprint Focus:	
Tags:			

Description

Hey,

I configured a form with 2 Checkbox groups. In the example shown on the screens below I only checked item 1 and item 3 of the first Checkgroup.

This is fine so far.

But if I try to rewrite the layout for checkboxes via

```
checkbox (
    <input />
    <label />
)
```

The HTML part of the sent mail breaks totally. It seems, that the `<input />` isn't replaced with an empty string or what else. The two screenshots show the correct rendering and the wrong rendering with own checkbox layout. Both form had the same state (item 1 and item 3 as explained above)

The HTML of the mail in the broken example is as follows (excerpt):

```
<table cellpadding=3D"0">
  <tbody>
    <tr>
      =
      <td colspan=3D"2">
        <table cellpadding=3D"0" style=3D"padding-left: 20px; margin-bottom: 20px;">
          <thead>
            <tr>
              <th colspan=3D"2" align=
n=3D"left">Ich interessiere mich f=C3=BCr</th>
            </tr>=
          </thead>
          <tbody>
            =
            <tr>
              <td colspan=3D"2">
                <input />
                <em>item1=
</em>
              </td>
            </tr>
            <tr>
              =
              <td colspan=3D"2">
                <input />
              </td>
            </tr>
          </tbody>
        </table>
      </td>
    </tr>
  </tbody>
</table>
```

```

                <em>item2</em>
            =
        </tr>
            <tr>
                <input />
            =
                <em>item3</em>
            </tr>
        =
    </tbody>
</table>
</td>

```

Related issues:

Related to TYPO3 Core - Bug #32463: New Form ext throws error on missing wraps	Closed	2011-12-12
Related to TYPO3 Core - Bug #37349: Layout change modifies email output	Closed	2012-05-21
Related to TYPO3 Core - Bug #39138: sysEXT:form checkbox send as input field ...	Closed	2012-07-20
Related to TYPO3 Core - Bug #58598: tx_form breaks on custom label	Closed	2014-05-07
Related to TYPO3 Core - Bug #45606: Forms: Mail-Layout destroyed	Closed	2013-02-19
Related to TYPO3 Core - Bug #42500: Sysext form output not adjustable via ts ...	Closed	2012-10-29
Related to TYPO3 Core - Bug #60995: tx_form PostProcessor - wrong layout hand...	Closed	2014-08-15
Related to TYPO3 Core - Bug #70086: EXT:form - Bring back view specific layou...	Closed	2015-09-24
Has duplicate TYPO3 Core - Bug #57830: Mailform	Closed	2014-04-11
Precedes TYPO3 Core - Bug #59549: Broken tests due to modified PostProcessor ...	Closed	2014-06-13

Associated revisions

Revision 8bd1988d - 2014-06-13 13:22 - Cornel Boppart

[BUGFIX] Own Layout Breaks Mail Message

With this patch it is possible to configure custom layouts for the form, confirmation, and each type of post processor. The backward compatibility is given, because this does not override or break already existing configurations but provides some more options to configure specific steps of the form process independent of each other. Therefore it prevents from breaking the layout of the confirmation view and the HTML mail.

Resolves: #31951
 Releases: 6.2
 Change-Id: I3c015b53cd6d6efbd070d16bdc2111c7d60671aa
 Reviewed-on: <https://review.typo3.org/28526>
 Reviewed-by: Xavier Perseguers
 Tested-by: Xavier Perseguers
 Reviewed-by: Markus Klein
 Reviewed-by: Dmitry Dulepov
 Tested-by: Dmitry Dulepov

Revision 7c8b73d7 - 2014-06-13 16:02 - Oliver Hader

[BUGFIX] Broken tests due to modified PostProcessor constructor

Issue #31951 introduced a breaking change in changing the order of constructor arguments in the form PostProcessor. This could have been avoided since new TypoScriptFactory object is and was a singleton.

Resolves: #59549
 Releases: 6.2
 Change-Id: I1134d4440437e9fe03129241e63c0f0004712176
 Reviewed-on: <https://review.typo3.org/30714>
 Reviewed-by: Marc Bastian Heinrichs
 Reviewed-by: Oliver Hader
 Tested-by: Oliver Hader

Revision d93485dc - 2015-09-29 12:44 - Ralf Zimmermann

[BUGFIX] EXT:form - Bring back view specific layout settings

The issue #31951 introduced a solution for view specific layout settings (for the form and the confirmation page). This patchset restores the functionality and also allows a differing layout for the post processor/mail. Furthermore it supports the extraordinary layout settings of EXT:bootstrap_package which introduced some edge cases while changing radiogroups and checkboxgroups.

Resolves: #70086

Releases: master

Change-Id: Ie8d1075e535a5ad7528ff53ddcf0daa44408d53d

Reviewed-on: <http://review.typo3.org/43533>

Tested-by: Bjoern Jacob <bjoern.jacob@tritum.de>

Reviewed-by: Bjoern Jacob <bjoern.jacob@tritum.de>

Reviewed-by: Frans Saris <franssaris@gmail.com>

Tested-by: Frans Saris <franssaris@gmail.com>

History

#1 - 2011-11-21 14:17 - Jigal van Hemert

- Status changed from New to Needs Feedback

As far as I can determine it should be <inputvalue /> instead of <input />. Can you test this?

#2 - 2011-11-21 21:02 - Michael Feinbier

I did the layout override because I wanted in the form the input before the label. According to the manual this is the correct way. If i use <inputvalue /> no Checkbox is rendered in the form.

#3 - 2012-01-18 09:48 - Christjan Grabowski

Same Problem:

```
tt_content.mailform.20 {
    layout {
        radio (
            <input /><label />
        )
        checkbox (
            <input /><label />
        )
    }
}
```

FE-Rendering of the form is correct. The email after submit does not contain the selected options. Instead there are rendered input fields.

Typo3 4.6.3

#4 - 2012-04-09 04:25 - Franz Koch

this issue is related to [#32463](#) - custom layouts a) can cause exceptions and b) bork your html mail layout. Solution is described in [#32463](#)

#5 - 2013-08-26 10:03 - Alexander Opitz

Hi,

as this issue is very old. Does the problem still exists within newer versions of TYPO3 CMS (6.1)?

Or is this a duplicate of [#32463](#) ?

#6 - 2013-10-18 10:58 - Leon de Rijke

I can confirm this issue still exists with 6.1.5:

```
tt_content.mailform.20 {
    layout {
        checkbox = <input /><label/>
    }
}
```

Front-end rendering is correct. The email contains rendered input fields.

#7 - 2013-10-18 11:04 - Leon de Rijke

Alexander Opitz wrote:

Hi,

as this issue is very old. Does the problem still exists within newer versions of TYPO3 CMS (6.1)?

Or is this a duplicate of [#32463](#) ?

Although this issue is related to [#32463](#), I don't think it is a duplicate. [#32463](#) deals with a fatal error, this issue deals with borked HTML mail output. Maybe the solution would be the same.

#8 - 2014-02-20 16:58 - Alexander Opitz

- Status changed from Needs Feedback to New

- Is Regression set to No

#9 - 2014-03-04 01:45 - Felix Nagel

I can confirm this issue in TYPO3 4.7.17.

#10 - 2014-03-19 12:50 - Ben Walch

This issue still exists with 6.2.beta:

```
tt_content {
    mailform.20 {
        layout {
            form (
                <form role="form">
                    <containerWrap />
                </form>
            )
            containerWrap (
                <div class="csc-mailform-container">
                    <elements />
                </div>
            )
            elementWrap (
                <div class="form-group">
                    <element />
                </div>
            )
            textline (
                <label />
                <input class="form-control" />
            )
            textarea (
                <label />
                <textarea class="form-control" />
            )
            textblock (
                <p class="help-block">
                    <textblock />
                </p>
            )
            submit (
                <input class="btn btn-primary" />
            )
        }
    }
}
```

This layout example above to have nice bootstrap-like form elements will brake the Html Mail Message.

Following the Manual, the `tt_content.mailform.20.layout` TypoScript is a layout definition (override) for the Frontend which works like a charm.. The bad thing is, that the `AbstractElementView.php` in `form/Classes/View/Mail/Html/Element` **also respects a layout override for the frontend** like above to render the HTML Code for the mail message.

This is a serious problem. The solution should be simple:

give the opportunity to define different layouts for the frontend as well as for the html mail, like

```
tt_content {
    mailform.20 {
        # Layout Override for the Frontend HTML View
        form {
            layout {
```

```

        elementWrap (
            ...
        )
    }
}
# Layout Override for the HTML Mail Message
mail {
    layout {
        elementWrap (
            ...
        )
    }
}
}
}

```

#11 - 2014-03-19 16:27 - Gerrit Code Review

- Status changed from New to Under Review

Patch set 1 for branch **master** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server. It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/28526>

#12 - 2014-04-15 10:40 - Anja Leichsenring

- TYPO3 Version changed from 4.6 to 6.2

- PHP Version deleted (5.3)

Sorry to say this, but the patch does not solve the issue. Please provide the form configuration of your form, the typoscript of your overridden layout and maybe some thoughts, how you developed the solution provided here, to get me in the right direction.

Additionally this means (probably) a breaking change to existing form configurations, and this is something that we need to avoid.

#13 - 2014-04-15 14:32 - Benjamin Kott

From my point of view and different testcases the layouts are not useable at all in its current state so whatever gets decided how to solve this problem it will not break any functionality somewhere.

The only way to get the ext:form working correctly at its current state is to xclass every view model and change the default layout directly in the model.

Views in 6.2

- Form (uses layout)
- Confirmation (uses layout)
- Mail (is a postProcessor)
- Html (uses layout)
- Plain (does not use layouts)

Example Default Layouts why the system breaks:

TextlineElementView (Form)

```

<label />
<input />

```

TextlineElementView (Confirmation)

```

<label />
<inputvalue />

```

TextlineElementView (Mail/Html)

```

<td style="width: 200px;">
  <label />
</td>
<td>
  <inputvalue />
</td>

```

The problem here is when you try to what the different views do not support all elements in its parseXML functions, for example the <input /> is not handled by the confirmation or the mail views under certain conditions the system then will break.

An example of an breaking ext:form configuration can be found in the bootstrap_package that comes with the introduction distribution.

```
tt_content.mailform.20 {
  layout {
    form (
      <form class="form-horizontal">
        <containerWrap />
      </form>
    )
    containerWrap (
      <div>
        <elements />
      </div>
    )
    elementWrap (
      <div>
        <element />
      </div>
    )
    fieldset (
      <fieldset><legend /><containerWrap /></fieldset>
    )
    label (
      <label>
        <labelvalue />
        <mandatory />
      </label>
    )
    error (
      <span class="help-block text-danger"><errorvalue /></span>
    )

    textline (
      <div class="form-group">
        <div class="col-sm-3 control-label">
          <label />
        </div>
        <div class="col-sm-5">
          <input class="form-control" />
          <error />
        </div>
      </div>
    )
    textarea (
      <div class="form-group">
        <div class="col-sm-3 control-label">
          <label />
        </div>
        <div class="col-sm-5">
          <textarea class="form-control" />
          <error />
        </div>
      </div>
    )
    submit (
      <div class="form-group">
        <div class="col-sm-offset-3 col-sm-9">
          <input class="btn btn-primary" />
        </div>
      </div>
    )
    checkbox (
      <div class="form-group">
        <div class="col-sm-offset-3 col-sm-9">
          <div class="checkbox">
            <input />
            <label />
          </div>
          <error />
        </div>
      </div>
    )
  }
  stdWrap.wrap = |
}
```

Suggestion:

Introduce new strict separation for the form layout and correct the typoscript settings for this.

- form.layout used only for form
- confirmation.layout used only for confirmation
- postProcessorDefaults.mail.layout used only for postprocessor mail layout
- postProcessorDefaults.Vendor\ExtensionKey\PostProcess\CustomPostProcessor.layout for example usage in custom postprocessor

Map current layout to -> form.layout so that nothing will break when someone already uses this.

```
tt_content.mailform.20 {
    form {
        ...
        layout {
            ...
        }
    }
    confirmation {
        message = TEXT
        message {
            value = Check input
            wrap = <p>|</p><hr/>
        }
        layout {
            ...
        }
    }
    postProcessorDefaults {
        mail {
            layout {
                ...
            }
        }
        Vendor\ExtensionKey\PostProcess\CustomPostProcessor {
            layout {
                ...
            }
        }
    }
    postProcessor {
        1 = mail
        1 {
            recipientEmail = {$plugin.tx_form.mail.recipientEmail}
            senderEmail = {$plugin.tx_form.mail.senderEmail}
            subject = {$plugin.tx_form.mail.subject}
            messages {
                success = Mail send.
            }
            mail {
                layout {
                    ...
                }
            }
        }
    }
}
```

#14 - 2014-05-06 13:39 - Toni no-lastname-given

- File broken_form.jpg added

I can also confirm the bug, tried lots of things but nothing worked.

I attached the mail i get after submitting my form, cant get any info unless i inspect whole mail and i cant ask my client to do that.

Btw, any way of to enable plain mail from form in 6.2 form?

#15 - 2014-05-28 08:08 - Cornel Boppart

- File form_using_different_layouts.diff added

With this patch it is possible to configure custom layouts for the form, confirmation, and each type of post processor.

The backward compatibility is given, because this does not override or break already existing configurations but provides some more options to configure specific steps of the form process independent of each other.

Therefore it prevents from breaking the layout of the confirmation view and the HTML mail.

```
tt_content.mailform.20 {  
  
    // Fallback and compatibility  
  
    layout {  
        ...  
    }  
  
    // Custom layouts  
  
    form {  
        layout {  
            ...  
        }  
    }  
  
    confirmation {  
        layout {  
            ...  
        }  
    }  
  
    postProcessor {  
        mail {  
            layout {  
                ...  
            }  
        }  
        ...  
    }  
}
```

#16 - 2014-05-28 22:32 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 2 for branch **master** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/28526>

#17 - 2014-05-28 23:09 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 3 for branch **master** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/28526>

#18 - 2014-05-28 23:12 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 5 for branch **master** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/28526>

#19 - 2014-05-29 08:34 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 6 for branch **master** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/28526>

#20 - 2014-05-29 12:03 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 7 for branch **master** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/28526>

#21 - 2014-06-12 10:39 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 8 for branch **master** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/28526>

#22 - 2014-06-13 13:30 - Cornel Boppart

- Status changed from Under Review to Resolved
- % Done changed from 0 to 100

Applied in changeset [8bd1988d82256c1851b426e1e86b04c308a3b50f](https://review.typo3.org/28526).

#23 - 2015-07-19 12:39 - Bjoern Jacob

- Category changed from Form Framework to 1602

#24 - 2015-11-17 20:41 - Bjoern Jacob

- Category changed from 1602 to Form Framework

#25 - 2018-10-02 12:19 - Benni Mack

- Status changed from Resolved to Closed

Files

forms-checkbox-working.png	48.7 KB	2011-11-20	Michael Feinbier
forms-checkbox-broken.png	70.5 KB	2011-11-20	Michael Feinbier
broken_form.jpg	15.7 KB	2014-05-06	Toni no-lastname-given
form_using_different_layouts.diff	6.54 KB	2014-05-28	Cornel Boppart