

## TYPO3.Kickstart - Bug #48030

### Kickstarter creates superfluous code

2013-05-07 19:56 - Bastian Waidelich

<b>Status:</b>	Resolved	<b>Start date:</b>	2013-05-07
<b>Priority:</b>	Should have	<b>Due date:</b>	
<b>Assignee:</b>	Bastian Waidelich	<b>% Done:</b>	100%
<b>Category:</b>		<b>Estimated time:</b>	0.00 hour
<b>Target version:</b>	2.0		
<b>Description</b>			
The kickstarter creates a lot of code that is not needed (especially redundant doc comments)			

#### Associated revisions

##### Revision 4de1a56d - 2013-05-08 11:43 - Bastian Waidelich

[BUGFIX] Kickstarter creates superfluous code

The kickstarter creates a lot of code that is not needed.  
Especially redundant doc comments are counter productive.

This change tweaks and cleans up the generator templates so that they create less noise.

This also comes with following minor improvements:

- Remove leading slash from use statement
- Replace "<f:form name" with "<f:form objectName"
- Move formatting ViewHelpers to subdirectory for good measure

Change-Id: I36c50d9148065b8394712f4e36ecab69aaa4ce92

Fixes: #48030

Releases: master, 2.0

##### Revision 6c77979c - 2013-05-22 09:58 - Bastian Waidelich

[BUGFIX] Kickstarter creates superfluous code

The kickstarter creates a lot of code that is not needed.  
Especially redundant doc comments are counter productive.

This change tweaks and cleans up the generator templates so that they create less noise.

This also comes with following minor improvements:

- Remove leading slash from use statement
- Replace "<f:form name" with "<f:form objectName"
- Move formatting ViewHelpers to subdirectory for good measure

Change-Id: I36c50d9148065b8394712f4e36ecab69aaa4ce92

Fixes: #48030

Releases: master, 2.0

#### History

##### #1 - 2013-05-07 20:02 - Gerrit Code Review

- Status changed from Accepted to Under Review

Patch set 1 for branch **master** has been pushed to the review server.  
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/20596>

##### #2 - 2013-05-08 11:40 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 2 for branch **master** has been pushed to the review server.  
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/20596>

### #3 - 2013-05-08 11:43 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 3 for branch **master** has been pushed to the review server.  
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/20596>

### #4 - 2013-05-08 12:09 - Bastian Waidelich

#### A little "pleading" against automatic (doc) comments:

The only situation where I would be in favor of a kickstarter adding comments is where it would be clever enough to add **meaning** (e.g. by determining the mechanics/domain logic behind a function so that it can be explained more comprehensible than the actual code).  
I doubt that this is possible because A: the kickstarter would have to be very very clever and B: at the stage of kickstarting "dumb" code, there is not much meaning to explain (apart from the technical workings which are the same for all MVC apps).

This is the code the kickstarter currently generates for domain models:

```
/**
 * A Beer
 *
 * @Flow\Entity
 */
class Beer {

    /**
     * The name
     * @var string
     */
    protected $name;

    /**
     * Get the Beer's name
     *
     * @return string The Beer's name
     */
    public function getName() {
        return $this->name;
    }

    /**
     * Sets this Beer's name
     *
     * @param string $name The Beer's name
     * @return void
     */
    public function setName($name) {
        $this->name = $name;
    }
}
```

I think the following is exactly as meaningful:

```
/**
 * @Flow\Entity
 */
class Beer {

    /**
     * @var string
     */
    protected $name;

    /**
     * @return string
     */
    public function getName() {
        return $this->name;
    }

    /**
     * @param string $name
     * @return void
     */
    public function setName($name) {
```

```
$this->name = $name;
}
}
```

Obviously I'm not against doc comments at all! But I doubt that they are something the computer can take over (apart from annotations of course).

## Boilerplate comments won't encourage developers to explain themselves

Lets face it, there are two kinds of developers: Those who care about doc comments and those who don't. IMO we can't really change this (apart from giving a good example in the framework code). I've seen so much code already where doc comments still referred to the copied function, property or even package – this is rather **counter-productive**.

So I think it's the other way around: devs are discouraged to adjust doc comments if everything looks "fine". That's why I even suggest to leave out class doc comments (apart from annotations) – it's not worse than a wrong doc comment and a decent IDE (e.g. PhpStorm) will highlight the line with a "Missing PHPDoc comment" warning (depending on the inspections settings).

### #5 - 2013-05-08 12:15 - Rens Admiraal

+1 to the plead ;)

### #6 - 2013-05-08 12:34 - Aske Ertmann

+1 from me as well.. do this already personally

### #7 - 2013-05-08 19:21 - Christian Müller

+1

### #8 - 2013-05-10 15:35 - Bastian Waidelich

- *Status changed from Under Review to Resolved*

- *% Done changed from 0 to 100*

Applied in changeset [4de1a56d356203540a0c8a1ef1f20b58fbee3dc8](#).

### #9 - 2013-05-22 09:59 - Gerrit Code Review

- *Status changed from Resolved to Under Review*

Patch set 1 for branch **2.0** has been pushed to the review server.

It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/20966>

### #10 - 2013-06-24 13:37 - Bastian Waidelich

- *Status changed from Under Review to Resolved*

Applied in changeset [6c77979c1add13e054ba71b0122af175cf28c1c3](#).