

TYPO3 Core - Bug #70812

edit user or usergroup > cannot remove every permission on file/directories

2015-10-17 17:18 - Riccardo De Contardi

Status:	Accepted	Start date:	2015-10-17
Priority:	Must have	Due date:	
Assignee:		% Done:	0%
Category:	Backend User Interface	Estimated time:	0.00 hour
Target version:	Candidate for patchlevel	Complexity:	
TYPO3 Version:	8	Is Regression:	Yes
PHP Version:	5.6	Sprint Focus:	
Tags:			

Description

Steps to reproduce:

- 1) System > backend user module (or root > list)
- 2) click + to create a new user
- 3) remove EVERY permission
- 4) on the tab "Mounts and workspaces" > "Fileoperation permissions:" uncheck everything both on "directory" and "files" list.
- 5) save

Result: "directory" and "files" lists still have checked options (the one you unchecked before) that is:

Directory: Read
Directory: Write
Directory: Add
Directory: Rename
Directory: Move
Directory: Delete

Files: Read
Files: Write
Files: Add
Files: Rename
Files: Replace
Files: Move
Files: Delete

(see attached file)

- you have to remove EVERYTHING from both to have this situation: if you keep at least one setting in one of the lists, the result is saved and not reverted
- this issue does not seem present on 6.2.15

Related issues:

Related to TYPO3 Core - Bug #71020: Backendgroups / Rights for fileoperations	Closed	2015-10-26
Related to TYPO3 Core - Bug #76033: Invalid default value for be group/user f...	Closed	2016-05-03
Related to TYPO3 Core - Bug #77705: No observance for the permissions for fi...	Closed	2016-08-31
Related to TYPO3 Core - Bug #77704: Permissions for fileoperations	Closed	2016-08-31
Related to TYPO3 Core - Bug #80279: Default language can't be selected/stored	New	2017-03-14
Related to TYPO3 Core - Bug #65573: File operation permissions are not correc...	Closed	2015-03-06
Related to TYPO3 Core - Bug #88312: User group definitions not saved properly	Closed	2019-05-09
Related to TYPO3 Core - Bug #89643: file permissions cannot not both be empty	Closed	2019-11-11
Has duplicate TYPO3 Core - Bug #76035: Unable to remove all directory and fil...	Closed	2016-05-03
Has duplicate TYPO3 Core - Bug #81506: formEngine: fileoperation permissions ...	Closed	2017-06-07

History

#1 - 2015-10-26 21:05 - Riccardo De Contardi

- Subject changed from create a new user > cannot remove every permission on file/directories to edit user or usergroup > cannot remove every permission on file/directories

the issue affects also usergroups, not only users. See also [#71020](#)

#2 - 2016-01-18 14:36 - Riccardo De Contardi

This issue is still valid for the latest 8.0-dev master

#3 - 2016-05-03 18:14 - Markus Klein

- Status changed from New to Accepted
- Priority changed from Should have to Must have
- Target version set to Candidate for patchlevel
- Sprint Focus set to Stabilization Sprint

#4 - 2016-08-24 17:18 - Daniel Windloff

I had the same problem on an own TCA configuration.
I think this bug has the following reason:

In

```
typo3/sysext/backend/Classes/Form/Element/SelectCheckBoxElement.php
```

line 114 the default value for an empty list is defined as "".

```
$html[] = '<input type="hidden" class="select-checkbox" name="' . htmlspecialchars($parameterArray['itemFormElName']) . '" value="">';
```

In

```
DataHandler::castReferenceValue
```

the value "" would be replaced by the default value defined in TCA.

Changing the return of castReferenceValue or the default value could be breaking change in some scenarios.

#5 - 2016-09-01 09:41 - Frans Saris

- Is Regression changed from No to Yes

#6 - 2017-02-17 22:57 - Riccardo De Contardi

Still affects both 7.6.15 and the latest master.

#7 - 2017-06-07 17:16 - Josef Glatz

- Has duplicate Bug #81506: formEngine: fileoperation permissions not possible to persist if no permission ist selected added

#8 - 2017-06-07 17:45 - Josef Glatz

- TYPO3 Version changed from 7 to 8
- Sprint Focus deleted (Stabilization Sprint)

8LTS and 9-dev (master) still affected

#9 - 2017-08-30 15:10 - M S

Thats a really hard bug since a few years. Would be nice if somebody could fix this.

#10 - 2017-08-30 15:37 - Markus Klein

I took a look already some time ago. It is also super hard to fix this!
I wasn't yet able to figure out if this would result in a major breaking change of DataHandler.

#11 - 2017-08-31 13:13 - M S

Markus Klein wrote:

I took a look already some time ago. It is also super hard to fix this!

I wasn't yet able to figure out if this would result in a major breaking change of DataHandler.

Would it be able to add a temporary checkbox like "no permissions"?

#12 - 2019-01-18 22:21 - Riccardo De Contardi

- Related to Bug #80279: Default language can't be selected/stored added

#13 - 2019-03-07 17:13 - Susanne Moog

- Related to Bug #65573: File operation permissions are not correctly inherited from group when field in user is NULL added

#14 - 2019-05-09 09:25 - Robert Wildling

- Related to Bug #88312: User group definitions not saved properly added

#15 - 2019-12-18 10:02 - Riccardo De Contardi

- Related to Bug #89643: file permissions cannot not both be empty added

#16 - 2019-12-18 11:23 - Riccardo De Contardi

As reported by on [#89643](#) from Robert Wildling, this issue still affects TYPO3 9.5.x

#17 - 2020-04-11 23:18 - Riccardo De Contardi

Still present on latest master (10.4.0-dev)

#18 - 2020-04-11 23:27 - Riccardo De Contardi

I was thinking: the issue is still present, but... does it make sense to remove *every* permission from the file or directory operations? If I don't want let a group do anything on a filemount - not even read it - I should not give it to the group, am I right? I hope I explained myself.

Or is there some scenario that I am not considering?

My suggestions

1) Make the "Read" always checked and readonly - later we can even remove it from the view maybe.
I think that this would even prevent some "odd" config like Read: deny; Write: allow

or

2) print out an error or warning message if I try to remove everything and save (It could even be something like "you can't remove every permission from the directory / file; permissions reverted to the previous selection")

#19 - 2020-04-12 00:14 - Jonas Eberle

I think 1) is a very practical choice.

#20 - 2020-04-12 03:29 - Felix Rauch

Riccardo De Contardi wrote:

I was thinking: the issue is still present, but... does it make sense to remove *every* permission from the file or directory operations? If I don't want let a group do anything on a filemount - not even read it - I should not give it to the group, am I right? I hope I explained myself.

Or is there some scenario that I am not considering?

Well not technically in this case, but doesn't the underlying Form Engine issue still exist?

I remember wrangling this issue for a while with a project because the requirements stated some form should have a multi-checkbox list with default selection and possibility to select nothing.

I think if this issue would be closed with a workaround, the TCA documentation should be adjusted to give some indication that the behaviour I described is out of spec for that field type (which I could understand, the underlying issue is a nightmare to fix, at least it was when I attempted some years back)

#21 - 2020-04-12 09:46 - Riccardo De Contardi

@Felix Rauch I got your point, you are right;

I feel that multiple checkboxes on FormEngine are a bit unfortunate; there is another issue: it is not possible to mark them as required ;)

Anyway, so there are two separate issues here

- the technical one about FormEngine and multiple checkboxes
- the conceptual one about permissions on files and folder

Files

Schermata 2015-10-17 alle 17.12.39.png	52.7 KB	2015-10-17	Riccardo De Contardi
--	---------	------------	----------------------