

TYPO3 Core - Bug #75184

fileadmin/ (auto-created) is randomly offline

2016-03-18 11:45 - Justus Moroni

Status:	Closed	Start date:	2016-03-18
Priority:	Should have	Due date:	
Assignee:		% Done:	100%
Category:	File Abstraction Layer (FAL)	Estimated time:	0.00 hour
Target version:		Complexity:	
TYPO3 Version:	7	Is Regression:	No
PHP Version:	5.4	Sprint Focus:	On Location Sprint
Tags:			

Description

I have the following problem in one TYPO3 installation:

The auto-created fileadmin goes randomly offline without an exception or any log entry.

This does not happen on a specific time or on a specific action.

The time is random and I can't find a action that triggers this effect.

The logging is configured to log every entry, even infos. There is no entry in the log.

I have a scheduler task that checks the fileadmin every minute and logs the time for me. After that it activates the fileadmin. This is only a workaround and I would really need a solution.

I also checked the fileadmin permissions to see if there is a problem but this seems to be fine as well.

I also looked in the apache_log to see if any images could not be found but that was also clear.

I added temporary logging in the core functions to deactivate the file storage permanently and temporary. The problem is that these functions are not triggered at all.

The file is typo3/system/core/Classes/Resource/ResourceStorage.php. The two functions are "markAsPermanentlyOffline" and "makrAsTemporaryOffline".

My Question:

Did anybody have the same strange bug?

Are there more things to check that I did not think of?

Are there any other parts where the fileadmin can be set offline?

Related issues:

Related to TYPO3 Core - Bug #78256: All " are replaced with "/" when offline s...

Closed

2016-10-12

Associated revisions

Revision 157e1f26 - 2016-09-20 08:29 - Sascha Egerer

[BUGFIX] Do not turn storages automatically offline

Storages should not be taken offline automatically.

Currently the storage turns offline if a configuration error is detected.

But depending on the driver a configuration error can be a temporary problem that just exists for seconds (like local filemount is not available).

A storage should only be turned offline if you are in the backend context and the initialization fails.

Resolves: #75184

Releases: master, 7.6

Change-Id: Iddb18305f96df1a116a5d209bae41a73f5bb0ad2

Reviewed-on: <https://review.typo3.org/49798>

Tested-by: TYPO3com <no-reply@typo3.com>

Reviewed-by: Frans Saris <franssaris@gmail.com>

Tested-by: Frans Saris <franssaris@gmail.com>

Reviewed-by: Benni Mack <benni@typo3.org>
Reviewed-by: Stefan Neufeind <typo3.neufeind@speedpartner.de>
Tested-by: Stefan Neufeind <typo3.neufeind@speedpartner.de>
Tested-by: Sascha Egerer <sascha@sascha-egerer.de>

Revision 6a3ee818 - 2016-12-01 12:20 - Marc Willmann

[BUGFIX] Don't set resource storages permanently offline automatically

When the storage drive couldn't be initialized correctly the storage is only put offline for the current request. The error thrown by the driver is logged to database table sys_log as well.

Resolves: #75184
Releases: master, 7.6
Change-Id: I4b05b732f887c0679e9cdda77793e4b304ac3fdb
Reviewed-on: <https://review.typo3.org/50371>
Reviewed-by: Oliver Hader <oliver.hader@typo3.org>
Tested-by: Oliver Hader <oliver.hader@typo3.org>
Tested-by: TYPO3com <no-reply@typo3.com>
Reviewed-by: Anja Leichsenring <leichsenring@ab-softlab.de>
Tested-by: Anja Leichsenring <leichsenring@ab-softlab.de>

Revision cfc4aaf6 - 2016-12-01 12:21 - Marc Willmann

[BUGFIX] Don't set resource storages permanently offline automatically

When the storage drive couldn't be initialized correctly the storage is only put offline for the current request. The error thrown by the driver is logged to database table sys_log as well.

Resolves: #75184
Releases: master, 7.6
Change-Id: I4b05b732f887c0679e9cdda77793e4b304ac3fdb
Reviewed-on: <https://review.typo3.org/50816>
Reviewed-by: Anja Leichsenring <leichsenring@ab-softlab.de>
Tested-by: Anja Leichsenring <leichsenring@ab-softlab.de>

Revision c0e83fc8 - 2016-12-01 18:02 - Oliver Hader

[FOLLOWUP][BUGFIX] Don't set resource storages permanently offline

Resolves: #75184
Releases: master, 7.6
Change-Id: Iff4ea23dfc1e8d96c45ba675aab6484830468718
Reviewed-on: <https://review.typo3.org/50836>
Tested-by: TYPO3com <no-reply@typo3.com>
Reviewed-by: Anja Leichsenring <leichsenring@ab-softlab.de>
Tested-by: Anja Leichsenring <leichsenring@ab-softlab.de>

Revision bdec6bdd - 2016-12-01 18:02 - Oliver Hader

[FOLLOWUP][BUGFIX] Don't set resource storages permanently offline

Resolves: #75184
Releases: master, 7.6
Change-Id: Iff4ea23dfc1e8d96c45ba675aab6484830468718
Reviewed-on: <https://review.typo3.org/50837>
Reviewed-by: Anja Leichsenring <leichsenring@ab-softlab.de>
Tested-by: Anja Leichsenring <leichsenring@ab-softlab.de>

History

#1 - 2016-03-19 22:07 - Frans Saris

- Status changed from New to Needs Feedback

As far as I could find by a quick search only the two functions mention and the data handler (used by the BE forms) set the is_online value.

Are you sure your custom logging is working as this would be my guess to look for this.

#2 - 2016-03-24 09:42 - Daniel Siepmann

I'm a colleague of Justus.

We have commented the source code out, and the fileadmin still goes offline.

We are still investigating whether something from outside of TYPO3 generates the issue, as we can't find any other place inside of TYPO3 that can do the trick.

#3 - 2016-05-13 14:52 - Fabrice Morin

We have the same problem with all storages, not only fileadmin, using TYPO3 6.2.19.
There are no server logs indicating access errors to fileadmin directory.
Waiting for more information, we had to make a task to set all storages online recurrently.
I wonder why storages can't be set online automatically when they are offline.

#4 - 2016-09-02 22:55 - Gerrit Code Review

- Status changed from Needs Feedback to Under Review

Patch set 1 for branch **master** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/49798>

#5 - 2016-09-02 22:56 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 2 for branch **master** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/49798>

#6 - 2016-09-03 14:49 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 3 for branch **master** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/49798>

#7 - 2016-09-03 14:59 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 4 for branch **master** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/49798>

#8 - 2016-09-03 15:17 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 5 for branch **master** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/49798>

#9 - 2016-09-03 16:43 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 6 for branch **master** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/49798>

#10 - 2016-09-20 08:30 - Sascha Egerer

- Status changed from Under Review to Resolved
- % Done changed from 0 to 100

Applied in changeset [157e1f269902c9b3ab57c95f71534949606fc658](https://review.typo3.org/49798).

#11 - 2016-09-20 09:19 - Gerrit Code Review

- Status changed from Resolved to Under Review

Patch set 1 for branch **TYPO3_7-6** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/49978>

#12 - 2016-10-06 09:54 - Jan Helke

- Sprint Focus set to On Location Sprint

#13 - 2016-10-12 12:43 - Helmut Hummel

- Status changed from Under Review to New

#14 - 2016-10-12 12:48 - Helmut Hummel

change has been reverted here: <https://review.typo3.org/#/c/50192/>

#15 - 2016-10-12 12:48 - Helmut Hummel

- % Done changed from 100 to 40

#16 - 2016-10-21 16:44 - Stephan Großberndt

- Subject changed from *fileadmin/ (auto-created) is randomly offline* to *fileadmin/ (auto-created) is randomly offline*

#17 - 2016-10-24 21:35 - Marc Willmann

Is it by intention in `typo3/sysext/core/Classes/Resource/ResourceStorage.php` public function `isOnline()` that `$this->isOnline` is SET in this method (under some circumstances)?

Could that be a possible cause for this "offline" problem?

IMHO the `isOnline()` function should only return true/false but never manipulate an internal variable. Is there some "hidden magic" why this is done?

Any ideas how to cover this issue with some tests?

#18 - 2016-10-25 17:22 - Gerrit Code Review

- Status changed from *New* to *Under Review*

Patch set 1 for branch **master** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server. It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/50371>

#19 - 2016-10-25 19:21 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 2 for branch **master** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server. It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/50371>

#20 - 2016-10-25 21:37 - Frans Saris

IMO the "feature" that the `ResourceStorage` sets the storage automatically permanent offline doesn't make sense. Also temporary disabling doesn't make sense for the `LocalDriver` provided by the core as it is just a single file system call that determine the storage isn't available.

In general just look at it like our main DB connection. You also don't want the DB to be marked offline by 1 glitch, not even for a few seconds.

Sure there are drivers where it makes sense to disable it for a few seconds/minutes to not DDOS a remote service. But the only part of FAL that can now such a requirement is the `Driver`. So if such a behaviour is desired by a `Driver` this should be handled by the driver as only the driver knows what timeouts are reasonable for it type. This could for instance be implemented in the `processConfiguration()` method of the driver.

I propose the following changes:

1. Remove the whole "automatically" permanent disabling of a storage by the `ResourceStorage` but only set it offline for current request so call `markAsTemporaryOffline()` instead of `markAsPermanentlyOffline()` and let it only set `$this->isOnline = false`;
2. Add a check to the BE form to check if the storage is online after save
Similar check like is done for `is_public` in `\TYPO3\CMS\Core\Resource\Service\UserStorageCapabilityService`.
Create a `userFunc` `renderIsOnline` that checks if this storage is temporary offline and if so disables the checkbox `is_online` and presents the admin with a flash message like is done for `is_public`
Maybe build the driver like is done in the `ResourceStorage` constructor and to catch and display the exception in the flashmessage
3. Deprecate `ResourceStorage::markAsPermanentlyOffline()`
4. Cleanup `ResourceStorage` to make the whole online check better readable

This should be 2 different patches. 1 with the first 2 points with a backport to 7.6, a second with the cleanup.

#21 - 2016-10-25 21:37 - Frans Saris

- *TYPO3 Version* changed from *6.2* to *7*

#22 - 2016-10-25 21:55 - Marc Willmann

I second 1), 3) and 4).

Regarding 2)... if we disable the checkbox `is_online` we have the same issue as now; in fact `ResourceStorage::markAsPermanentlyOffline()` does exact this: uncheck the `is_online` checkbox and cause several trouble with this.

For local resources IMHO we don't need any temporary or even permanent "offline mode" as the check for availability is really cheap. For remote resources this may be different.

Quick test earlier today caused some errors in the backend if the (unavailable) resource isn't marked as offline at all; I'll spend some testing time to isolate this.

#23 - 2016-10-25 22:10 - Frans Saris

If you look at `\TYPO3\CMS\Core\Resource\Service\UserStorageCapabilityService` you see that for `is_public` only the checkbox is unchecked. This value is only persisted when you save the form again. So it still isn't really disabled automatically. But the flashmessage is the important part here. That will tell the admin what is going on so he can react on it.

So the `is_online` value is only persisted by action of the admin, not by just visiting the backend

#24 - 2016-10-26 19:59 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 3 for branch `master` of project `Packages/TYPO3.CMS` has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/50371>

#25 - 2016-10-26 20:18 - Marc Willmann

Hmm. I'm quite not really happy with this solution; as this would also introduce an UI/UX-change (which might to be discussed to be useful or not; but I would like to see this discussion in another ticket to do not block this (stand-alone) bugfix, which is likely overdue.

I have pushed another patchset <https://review.typo3.org/#/c/50371/> to be reviewed; in this patchset the resource storage is neither set offline temporary or permanent; so some flaky resources are back in the system as soon they are reachable again; this is important esp. in NFS-scenarios, where some files(systems) are sometimes for short time not available (and the old code may hit such a timeframe and set the resource offline forever).

I would like to see a discussion on the given patch; as follow-up to these patch (if accepted) there should be some cleanup, esp. deprecation of the `markAsTemporaryOffline()` and `markAsPermaentOffline()` methods as they are no longer used in the core (and likely not in any other extension).

If some drivers needs to set resource storages offline for more than it's really not available, this behavior should be configurable in the driver and/or the resource storage; the actual standard is not suitable really good for most cases (and therefore abandoned in the named patch).

Also to be discussed in the follow-up discussion to this patch is the UI/UX behavior which should occur - IMHO there is not even one reason to set a storage offline except the admin does this especially for maintenance reasons (which works). A useful reaction to a non-reachable resource could be a flash-message, an email to an administrator, an entry into syslog or a combination of these. But I think, we should reduce complexity for the bugfix issue and not increase it by adding additional functionality (which of course can be done in another ticket).

#26 - 2016-10-27 09:26 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 4 for branch `master` of project `Packages/TYPO3.CMS` has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/50371>

#27 - 2016-10-27 12:05 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 5 for branch `master` of project `Packages/TYPO3.CMS` has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/50371>

#28 - 2016-10-27 13:06 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 6 for branch `master` of project `Packages/TYPO3.CMS` has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/50371>

#29 - 2016-11-15 13:34 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 7 for branch `master` of project `Packages/TYPO3.CMS` has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/50371>

#30 - 2016-11-15 13:34 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 8 for branch `master` of project `Packages/TYPO3.CMS` has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/50371>

#31 - 2016-11-16 20:31 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 9 for branch `master` of project `Packages/TYPO3.CMS` has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/50371>

#32 - 2016-11-16 21:35 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 10 for branch `master` of project `Packages/TYPO3.CMS` has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/50371>

#33 - 2016-12-01 12:07 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 11 for branch `master` of project `Packages/TYPO3.CMS` has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/50371>

#34 - 2016-12-01 12:21 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 1 for branch `TYPO3_7-6` of project `Packages/TYPO3.CMS` has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/50816>

#35 - 2016-12-01 12:21 - Marc Willmann

- Status changed from *Under Review* to *Resolved*

- % Done changed from 40 to 100

Applied in changeset [6a3ee818f1590a8fee0d119d9ed15fb35a904cef](#).

#36 - 2016-12-01 17:31 - Gerrit Code Review

- Status changed from Resolved to Under Review

Patch set 1 for branch **master** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/50836>

#37 - 2016-12-01 18:02 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 1 for branch **TYPO3_7-6** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/50837>

#38 - 2016-12-01 18:02 - Oliver Hader

- Status changed from Under Review to Resolved

Applied in changeset [c0e83fc8ad2db4aef08108b6b16841741963b60c](#).

#39 - 2018-10-02 11:18 - Benni Mack

- Status changed from Resolved to Closed