

TYPO3 Core - Epic #88528

Remove switchable controller action functionality

2019-06-07 21:05 - Alexander Schnitzler

Status:	In Progress	Start date:	2019-06-08
Priority:	Should have	Due date:	
Assignee:		% Done:	50%
Category:	Extbase	Estimated time:	0.00 hour
Target version:	Candidate for Major Version		
Sprint Focus:			

Description

Switchable controller actions are a way to override the controller-action-pairs – configured during the call to `\TYPO3\CMS\Extbase\Utility\ExtensionUtility::configurePlugin` and/or `\TYPO3\CMS\Extbase\Utility\ExtensionUtility::registerModule` – during runtime, mostly achieved by implementing a select element in a the flexform of a plugin. The actual configuration is therefore stored in the database and most likely very different from what can be seen in `ext_localconf.php`

Why have switchable controller actions been introduced?

Well, there are several different issues these switchable controller actions:

Allow setting both the default controller and the default action dynamically

Since there is a feature in Extbase called `skipDefaultArguments`, URL's do not need to contain the GET parameters for the controller and the action if the target controller and action are the default ones. This feature has been introduced to ease the pain of configuring nice URL's with `realurl`.

Allow to set custom controller-action-pairs for 3rd-party-extensions

Imagine you are using an extension that has a fixed configuration of controller-action-pairs and you would like to extend controller of said extension to add another action. In this case you could define a flexform for the plugin and override the configuration in there. It's not only possible to get rid of GET parameters that reflect default values of plugins, it's also possible to allow/disallow actions for controllers that have been disallowed/allowed previously.

Why should we get rid of switchable controller actions?

Well, the problem with this "feature" is, that configuration can be changed during runtime, which

- Source code is not the single source of truth
- Configuration can no longer be properly versioned (Git/SVN/...)
- Configuration can not be properly cached and displayed for debugging.

How can/should/will we get rid of switchable controller actions?

There are quite a few different steps to take here:

- First of all, we need to remove the restriction, that only configured pairs of controllers and their actions are allowed to be called. This will be done to remove the necessity to use switchable controller actions to allow non-configured controller-action-pairs. Using the configuration as some kind of firewall is an anti pattern anyway. Authentication and Authorization have to be implemented differently. Nevertheless, this change needs to be communicated very well because people might rely on actions not being callable.
- Next, the switchable controller actions defined via flexform will only be used to determine the default controller and its default action. Switchable controller actions may still define a list of actions, but only the first one will be evaluated to determine the default action.
- Then, `skipDefaultArguments` will be deprecated. This indicates that from TYPO3 version 11 on, links will no longer be created with missing GET parameters for both default controllers and default actions. To avoid having those params in links, route enhancer configurations have to be used and/or adjusted.
- In TYPO3 version 11, switchable controller actions will no longer be evaluated to determine default controller or default action. All links need to contain a controller and action parameter.
- Also, in TYPO3 version 11, `\TYPO3\CMS\Extbase\Utility\ExtensionUtility::configurePlugin` and

\TYPO3\CMS\Extbase\Utility\ExtensionUtility::registerModule will no longer accept a list of actions for (cached) controllers. Both methods will accept a list of allowed controllers and a list of uncached actions. The exact api is not yet defined as of this writing. Idea of Benni Mack: Actions could be marked uncached with a doctrine annotation.

Issues that need to be solved

- If there are two different plugins (with the same namespace like Pi1) on one page, both defining a different default action via switchable controller actions, the removal of the switchable controller actions leads to the problem, that one GET parameter defines the default action for both plugins. This means, that there still needs to be a way to set the default action other than via GET params.

Subtasks:

Task # 88529: Plugin configuration does no longer determine callable actions.

Under Review

Task # 89463: Deprecate switchable controller actions

Closed

Related issues:

Related to TYPO3 Core - Bug #71569: FrontendConfigurationManager::overrideSwi...	Closed	2015-11-13
Related to TYPO3 Core - Bug #73630: flexform data is not deleted when changin...	Accepted	2016-02-23
Related to TYPO3 Core - Bug #80365: Document switchableControllerActions	Closed	2017-03-21
Related to TYPO3 Core - Bug #73795: Bug when switching a extbase plugin with ...	New	2016-03-01
Related to TYPO3 Core - Bug #70378: switchableControllerActions overrides con...	New	2015-10-05
Related to TYPO3 Core - Bug #80101: Extbase getContentObject() gets no result...	Needs Feedback	2017-03-02
Related to TYPO3 Core - Task #88496: Replace switchable controller actions te...	Closed	2019-06-05

History

#1 - 2019-06-08 08:37 - Alexander Schnitzler

- Description updated

#2 - 2019-06-08 08:39 - Alexander Schnitzler

- Description updated

#3 - 2019-10-21 12:22 - Alexander Schnitzler

- Related to Bug #71569: FrontendConfigurationManager::overrideSwitchableControllerActionsFromFlexForm does not check if plugin has flexform added

#4 - 2019-10-21 12:25 - Alexander Schnitzler

- Related to Bug #73630: flexform data is not deleted when changing plugin added

#5 - 2019-10-21 23:15 - Riccardo De Contardi

- Related to Bug #80365: Document switchableControllerActions added

#6 - 2020-03-02 18:18 - Georg Ringer

- Status changed from New to In Progress

#7 - 2020-03-03 17:28 - Christian EBl

- Related to Bug #73795: Bug when switching a extbase plugin with flexforms "switchableControllerActions" to a plugin without flexform added

#8 - 2020-03-03 17:29 - Christian EBl

- Related to Bug #70378: switchableControllerActions overrides configuration of non-cacheable actions added

#9 - 2020-03-03 17:30 - Christian EBl

- Related to Bug #80101: Extbase getContentObject() gets no result by calling in another controller added

#10 - 2020-04-25 11:04 - Riccardo De Contardi

- Related to Task #88496: Replace switchable controller actions terminology added