

TYPO3 Core - Bug #92198

Localize method gets wrong PID from records generated during former free mode translations

2020-09-04 12:50 - Jo Hasenau

Status:	Closed	Start date:	2020-09-04
Priority:	Must have	Due date:	
Assignee:		% Done:	100%
Category:	Localization	Estimated time:	0.00 hour
Target version:	next-patchlevel	Complexity:	
TYPO3 Version:	10	Is Regression:	
PHP Version:		Sprint Focus:	
Tags:			

Description

Marked for CMS 11 - but happens in any supported version as well.

If translations have been done in the so called "free mode" aka "copy mode", you can move around the translated elements after the actual localize actions.

If you move those elements to another page now, they still point to the record of the default language via the field configured as "translationSource".

Unfortunately this information will again be used for upcoming localize actions, since the destination PID will be either a real PID or a negative value pointing to a record after which to position the translation copy.

This will lead to problems in lines 7249 to 7255 of \TYPO3\CMS\Core\DataHandling\DataHandler

```
// If there is an element, find its localized record in specified localization language
if ($previousRow = $queryBuilder->execute()->fetch()) {
    $previousLocalizedRecord = BackendUtility::getRecordLocalization($table, $previousRow['uid'],
    $language);
    if (is_array($previousLocalizedRecord[0])) {
        $previousLocalizedRecordUid = $previousLocalizedRecord[0]['uid'];
    }
}
```

BackendUtility::getRecordLocalization will just use the UID of the record but not check the PID, so it might return a record from a different page based on the translationSource field.

Now this will lead to a wrong PID for each of the following records, since they will be copied "after" the first one with the wrong PID.

The result is a mixed up set of elements with different PID values which actually should be on the same page after the localize action.

Of course they could be moved around in free mode after that action, but for the actual localization only records from the same PID should be taken into account.

People noticed that behaviour when dealing with nested Gridelements structures, but even without any additional Gridelements methods activated the problem stayed the same.

Should be similar with any other localize action that involves translated elements which have been moved to another page before.

Related issues:

Related to TYPO3 Core - Bug #92783: Record inserted on wrong pid	Closed	2020-11-06
Related to TYPO3 Core - Bug #93078: 9.5/10.4: DataHandler::getPreviousLocaliz...	Resolved	2020-12-15

Associated revisions

Revision d5366226 - 2021-03-25 16:52 - Philipp Parzer

[BUGFIX] Add pid restriction when getting previousLocalizedRecord

Scenario:

A content element 'ce-1-default' exists on a 'source' page. It has a 'free mode' localization 'ce-1-localized'. The localized

content element thus has l18n_parent=0 (free mode) and l10n_source='id-of-ce-1-default' - it has been derived from 'ce-1-default'.

Now 'ce-1-default' is moved to a different 'target' page. Due to free mode, 'ce-1-localized' is NOT moved along with its localization source, but keeps l10n_source='id-of-ce-1-default' (this needs to be discussed if we change this) and stays on 'source' page. This is ok.

Now, a new content element 'ce-2-default' is added on 'target' page, right below the previously moved 'ce-1-default'. And then, this element is localized.

DataHandler now tries to find out where to create this localized 'ce-2-localized' record relative to other records. It finds the localization 'ce-1-localized' due to its l10n_source indicator and then creates 'ce-2-localized' after 'ce-1-localized'. On the source page!

So the content element localization ends up on a different page, which is of course wrong, misleading and hard to understand!

To fix this, the Datahandler now finds translated content elements of a given content element only if it is on the same page. This keeps this 'relative-to' magic, and the content element does not end up on some foreign page.

Resolves: #92783

Resolves: #92198

Releases: master, 10.4

Change-Id: I104a4b2d59322ec55ad96e37e8d1b3c3fed0e515

Reviewed-on: <https://review.typo3.org/c/Packages/TYPO3.CMS/-/66552>

Tested-by: TYPO3com <noreply@typo3.com>

Tested-by: core-ci <typo3@b13.com>

Tested-by: Oliver Bartsch <bo@cedev.de>

Tested-by: Benni Mack <benni@typo3.org>

Tested-by: Christian Kuhn <lolli@schwarzbu.ch>

Reviewed-by: Oliver Bartsch <bo@cedev.de>

Reviewed-by: Benni Mack <benni@typo3.org>

Reviewed-by: Christian Kuhn <lolli@schwarzbu.ch>

Revision 753a304f - 2021-03-25 16:53 - Philipp Parzer

[BUGFIX] Add pid restriction when getting previousLocalizedRecord

Scenario:

A content element 'ce-1-default' exists on a 'source' page. It has a 'free mode' localization 'ce-1-localized'. The localized content element thus has l18n_parent=0 (free mode) and l10n_source='id-of-ce-1-default' - it has been derived from 'ce-1-default'.

Now 'ce-1-default' is moved to a different 'target' page. Due to free mode, 'ce-1-localized' is NOT moved along with its localization source, but keeps l10n_source='id-of-ce-1-default' (this needs to be discussed if we change this) and stays on 'source' page. This is ok.

Now, a new content element 'ce-2-default' is added on 'target' page, right below the previously moved 'ce-1-default'. And then, this element is localized.

DataHandler now tries to find out where to create this localized 'ce-2-localized' record relative to other records. It find the localization 'ce-1-localized' due to its l10n_source indicator and then creates 'ce-2-localized' after 'ce-1-localized'. On the source page!

So the content element localization ends up on a different page, which is of course wrong, misleading and hard to understand!

To fix this, the Datahandler now finds translated content elements of a given content element only if it is on the same page. This keeps this 'relative-to' magic, and the content element does not end up on some foreign page.

Resolves: #92783

Resolves: #92198

Releases: master, 10.4
Change-Id: I104a4b2d59322ec55ad96e37e8d1b3c3fed0e515
Reviewed-on: <https://review.typo3.org/c/Packages/TYPO3.CMS/+68612>
Tested-by: TYPO3com <noreply@typo3.com>
Tested-by: core-ci <typo3@b13.com>
Tested-by: Christian Kuhn <lolli@schwarzbu.ch>
Reviewed-by: Christian Kuhn <lolli@schwarzbu.ch>

History

#1 - 2020-09-04 12:51 - Jo Hasenau

- Description updated

#2 - 2020-11-19 06:56 - Denis Mir

I don't know what to say but this problem is getting more and more serious. We got this error now on a lot of projects. Translation of pages (and their CEs) does lead to records being assigned random PIDs. Random PIDs means that they appear on completely different pages. This can't wait till 11 LTS!

#3 - 2020-11-19 07:03 - Oliver Hader

- Status changed from New to Accepted

I did not not into the details, but it sounds reasonable.
Does this misbehavior only happen in the backend?
And if yes, for which actions and having which implication?

Thx for your feedback.

#4 - 2020-11-19 07:04 - Gerrit Code Review

- Status changed from Accepted to Under Review

Patch set 3 for branch **master** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/c/Packages/TYPO3.CMS/+66552>

#5 - 2020-11-19 07:10 - Philipp Parzer

- Related to Bug #92783: Record inserted on wrong pid added

#6 - 2020-11-19 07:27 - Denis Mir

Thank you very much for looking into the problem.

I have debugged it with Jo Hasenau after incorrectly blaming gridelements to be the cause for content elements that went missing after a simple translation process (copy mode) in the backend by our editors.

It happens when you translate the page content in free mode (copy mode). Editors translate the page content of a page in the page module of the backend. They choose the free mode in the modal.

Now it appeared that some content records get copied correctly and other content records are missing in the translation. Selecting for the specific page id and sys language uid in "tt_content" made it clear that they somehow disappeared.

At first I thought that only the gridelements columns are incorrectly assigned but thats not true missing records are not assigned at all to this page id. In development I was able to find the missing records by selecting only for the specific "crdate" of the copying process. (the correct crdate could be found by looking at the correctly copied records) So when only selecting for the "crdate" I get all the correctly copied records + the missing records. Only difference is the different pid.

Jo and I did found out that the incorrect pid comes from the translationSource. (Jo describes it in the issue description I can't do better)

For the editor it does mean that the translated records are gone and can only be fixed (at the moment) by juggling directly with the database. But it does also mean that these missing records do appear now on a completely different pages. (and these other pages look broke now)

If you need any more information I will provide it for you.

#7 - 2020-11-19 09:26 - Oliver Hader

Thanks for your feedback. The next steps seem to be

- create new functional tests to reproduce and demonstrate the scenario ("showing the database inconsistency")
- find potential solutions for the behavior in particular

#8 - 2020-11-19 09:26 - Oliver Hader

- TYPO3 Version changed from 11 to 10

#9 - 2020-11-20 06:47 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 4 for branch **master** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server. It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/c/Packages/TYPO3.CMS/+66552>

#10 - 2021-02-05 07:09 - Denis Mir

Guys please do finally merge that patch. This is a huge bug and it bugs us on every single project now. Content elements appear after translation on a random page. This is a blocker for every professional project.

#11 - 2021-02-05 07:13 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 5 for branch **master** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server. It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/c/Packages/TYPO3.CMS/+66552>

#12 - 2021-02-05 07:32 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 6 for branch **master** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server. It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/c/Packages/TYPO3.CMS/+66552>

#13 - 2021-02-08 09:10 - Sybille Peters

@Jo and @Denis

Apart from the bugfix / patch: If I understand this correctly, if you are already affected you will have to fix it in the database. The patch will only fix this happening in the future. Is that correct?

Can you add more information:

- How to reproduce the problem
- How can you check if you may be affected by this? (e.g. check for translationSource on different pid?)
- Is there a way to fix this in the database (e.g. set value for translationSource to 0 if pid of translation differs from pid of translationSource) for records already copied.
- Are any log messages / error messages produced?

I have not exactly understood the nature of the error.

I unsuccessfully tried to reproduce it.

(Understanding and reproducing the problem might also make it easier to test and review the patch).

#14 - 2021-03-24 14:17 - Christian Kuhn

Seems we're suffering from that in a project, too. Will fix / finish the patch now.

#15 - 2021-03-24 14:42 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 7 for branch **master** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server. It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/c/Packages/TYPO3.CMS/+66552>

#16 - 2021-03-24 15:14 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 8 for branch **master** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server. It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/c/Packages/TYPO3.CMS/+66552>

#17 - 2021-03-24 16:06 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 9 for branch **master** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server. It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/c/Packages/TYPO3.CMS/+66552>

#18 - 2021-03-24 16:56 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 10 for branch **master** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server. It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/c/Packages/TYPO3.CMS/+66552>

#19 - 2021-03-24 17:37 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 11 for branch **master** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server. It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/c/Packages/TYPO3.CMS/+66552>

#20 - 2021-03-24 17:38 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 12 for branch **master** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server.

It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/c/Packages/TYPO3.CMS/+66552>

#21 - 2021-03-24 17:40 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 13 for branch **master** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/c/Packages/TYPO3.CMS/+66552>

#22 - 2021-03-24 17:46 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 14 for branch **master** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/c/Packages/TYPO3.CMS/+66552>

#23 - 2021-03-24 19:13 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 1 for branch **10.4** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/c/Packages/TYPO3.CMS/+68612>

#24 - 2021-03-24 19:24 - Gerrit Code Review

Patch set 2 for branch **10.4** of project **Packages/TYPO3.CMS** has been pushed to the review server.
It is available at <https://review.typo3.org/c/Packages/TYPO3.CMS/+68612>

#25 - 2021-03-25 16:55 - Philipp Parzer

- *Status changed from Under Review to Resolved*
- *% Done changed from 0 to 100*

Applied in changeset [d5366226fd0562bb12f49f9959b46f6402796e62](https://review.typo3.org/c/Packages/TYPO3.CMS/+68612).

#26 - 2021-05-11 15:59 - Benni Mack

- *Status changed from Resolved to Closed*

#27 - 2021-10-20 01:24 - Christian Kuhn

- *Related to Bug #93078: 9.5/10.4: DataHandler::getPreviousLocalizedRecordUid() does not check pid added*